

LAH4930* The Native Struggle for Justice in the Spanish Empire

Flint 115

Instructor: Dr. Max Deardorff

Mon 12:50-3:50

Office Hours: Tues. 10-11am & Weds. 11am-1pm (339 Grinter)

Email: deardorff.max@ufl.edu

After almost three decades exploiting the natives of the Caribbean (1492-1519), Spaniards and African servants and slaves swept across Mesoamerica, allying with dissident native groups to conquer the empire of the Aztecs (also known as Mexica). In the 1530s, adventurers led by Francisco Pizarro achieved shocking success in toppling the leadership of the Inca Empire in South America. Until the 1570s, the waves of wholesale violence continued as soldiers, men-of-fortune, and native allies fanned out from the three poles of conquest (the Caribbean, Mexico, and Peru), conquering smaller polities and the native groups beyond the frontiers of pre-Hispanic empires.

Conquest was highly disruptive of native life. Beyond the violence of war, the conquest led to the spread of disease and famine; the enslavement of men, women, and children; the introduction of new fauna and flora (horses, cows, pigs, wheat, etc.); the foundation of a new hegemonic religion (Catholicism); and the introduction of a new legal code (i.e. Spanish law). All were elements that, one way or another, radically reshaped native life.

Many common people ('plebeians') suffered with the regime change. But others flourished. Pre-Hispanic elites often found themselves co-opted as agents of the new imperial power, and preserved or expanded their authority in the process. Some commoners even used their knowledge of the Spanish language and their understanding of its legal system to achieve prominence in a changing society. As Christianity spread, native communities adopted its practices and symbols, making it their own. Some natives became priest's assistants and catechists, achieving a modicum of authority in their local Catholic churches. In the decades after conquest, upwardly-mobile Christianized natives often maintained an uneasy relationship to traditional spiritual and temporal native authorities, whose functions continued to exist but were driven increasingly underground.

In this course, students have the opportunity to develop their own original scholarship – all while engaging with the latest historical writing on native subjects of the Spanish Empire. Students are encouraged to explore topics such as the interaction between natives and Spaniards during the process of conquest, the expansion of slavery, the battle for indigenous rights as imperial subjects, native writings about the conquest, the impact of Christian missionaries and the survival of native religions, the coexistence of indigenous communities with both free and enslaved Africans, conflict between natives and Spaniards over land rights, the slow transformation in the exercise of native authority and social norms, and the justification for native-led rebellions in the late eighteenth century.

How does a historian study these kinds of things? What kind of documents in the historical record can give us clues to help answer the questions that arise? Part of this course will be devoted to methodology – strategies that historians use for identifying and analyzing documents pertinent to their historical questions.

**Note: students may receive AFH or EUH credit for this class pending consultation with the professor and the Undergraduate Coordinator, Professor Ben Wise*

ASSIGNED BOOKS (Available at Bookstore and Course Reserve at the Library):

Gabriela Ramos and Yanna Yannakakis, eds., *Indigenous Intellectuals: Knowledge, Power, and Colonial Culture in Mexico and the Andes* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2014). ISBN-13: 9780822356608

Nancy Van Deusen, *Global Indios: The Indigenous Struggle for Justice in Sixteenth-Century Spain* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2015). ISBN-13: 9780822358589

Felipe Guaman Poma De Ayala, *The First New Chronicle and Good Government, Abridged*, David Frye ed. and transl. (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc., 2006). ISBN-13: 9780872208414

Ward Stavig and Ella Schmidt eds., *The Tupac Amaru and Catarista Rebellions: An Anthology of Sources* (Indianapolis: Hackett, 2008). ISBN-13: 9780872208452

The Libguide

This resource, prepared by the Latin American specialist at the Smathers Library (Dr. Margarita Vargas-Betancourt), should be your first stop as you prepare to write your research paper. <https://guides.uflib.ufl.edu/nativestruggle>

Professor's Website

Another website with useful links to a range of digital historical resources is the professor's very own: <http://maxdeardorff.org>

OXFORD RESEARCH ENCYCLOPEDIAS – LATIN AMERICAN HISTORY

The Oxford Research Encyclopedias offer very good and very up-to-date essays on Latin American Topics. They are a great place to start when you are beginning to read on your topic of choice. Consult on-campus through our library's homepage (<http://cms.uflib.ufl.edu/>) in order to get complete access.

http://latinamericanhistory.oxfordre.com/browse?t0=ORE_LAH:REFLAH022

Grades and Grading:

1. Seminar Participation 30%

By definition, a seminar is not a lecture class in which students' role is largely limited to listening, taking notes and active thinking. Instead, the success of a seminar depends on each student's willingness to complete the reading in advance of class and desire to share and debate ideas in an organized discussion led by the professor. The Professor will often provide introductory thoughts and context. His role is to inspire discussion, help craft ideas, draw out analytical patterns and explain/highlight the nature of scholarly methodology. Meanwhile:

- A student's final grade depends on consistent preparation for discussion and coherent, collegial participation in every class discussion.
- Every student is required to bring two or three questions (hard copy) on the seminar reading to class. Prof. will draw questions from this pool for that day's discussion.
- On the first day, each student will sign up to be a discussion leader for one of the assigned readings. Each seminar meeting, two students will then serve as discussion leaders. This exercise will encourage these students to examine the readings they select with greater care, thinking about the sources, the methods and the contribution of the book to the historiography of Latin America.

2. Short analytical writing 15%

- Each student will write a 5-page analysis of the strengths, weaknesses and methods of a set of readings that s/he has chosen to from the early weeks of the course.

3. Writing Process 25%

- By Monday February 8th, all students are required to have met with Professor to discuss the viability of a research topic and have it approved.
- An annotated bibliography (Week 8) and précis (Week 9) are due before proceeding to draft status.
- An oral presentation of research progress is due on either Week 12 or 13.
- The delivery of a Rough Draft (Week 13), to be followed by Peer Review (Week 14).

4. Final research paper (15-25 pages) 30%

Each member of the seminar must complete a research paper of 15-25 pages in length. Students will also offer a 10-15-minute oral presentation to their peers in a class meeting in April. The oral presentation is worth 5% of the research paper's grade.

- First drafts of the research paper in hard copy are due by Monday, April 8th.
- Professor will return first drafts to students on Monday, April 15th.
- Final drafts of the paper are due by Monday, April 29th.

Assignments

Seminar Participation:	30%		Annotated Bibliography (Week 8):	5%
Short Analytical Writing (Week 7):	15%		Precis (Week 9):	5%
Writing Process (see text box for breakdown)	25%	→	Oral Presentation (Week 12/13):	5%
Essay Final Draft:	30%		Rough Draft (Week 13):	5%
			Peer Review (Week 14):	5%

Grading Scale for this Course:

92.5-100	A	87.5-82.5	B	77.5-72.5	C	67.5-62.5	D
92.5-90	A-	82.5-80	B-	72.5-70	C-	62.5-60	D-
90-87.5	B+	80-77.5	C+	70-67.5	D+	<u>Below 60 - Failing</u>	

Schedule of Readings:

Please note that this course will use the CANVAS site. Readings outside of the assigned books for the course will be posted under “Resources.” This syllabus and any handouts or assignments will also appear there.

1. Introduction

Mon 1/7

READINGS:

Matthew Restall, “The New Conquest History” *History Compass* 10/2 (2012): 151–160;
 Susan Kellogg, “The Colonial Mosaic of Indigenous New Spain, 1519–1821” Ken Mills ed.,
Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Latin American History (New York: Oxford
 University Press, 2016):
<http://uf.catalog.fcla.edu.lp.hscl.ufl.edu/forward.jsp?ig=uf.jsp&type=link&link=http%3A%2F%2Flatinamericanhistory.oxfordre.com%2F>

2. The Early Caribbean, Indigenous Slavery, and the Native Struggle for Freedom

Mon 1/14

READINGS:

Nancy Van Deusen, *Global Indios The Indigenous Struggle for Justice in Sixteenth-Century Spain* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2015)

DOCUMENT ANALYSIS:

Nancy Van Deusen, "Beatriz, India's, Lawsuit for Freedom from Slavery (Castile, Spain, 1558-1574) in *Women in Colonial Latin America, 1526 to 1806* (2018): 14-29

3. NO CLASS THIS WEEK (Native Religion and the Catholic Church)

Mon 1/21,

THIS WEEK'S SPECIAL ASSIGNMENT:

1. PICK A (TENTATIVE) TOPIC FOR YOUR RESEARCH PAPER. This should INCLUDE A THEME –Weeks Two through Ten of this syllabus offer a number of feasible options—AND A CHRONOLOGICAL AND GEOGRAPHICAL FOCUS. Some themes—such as the Age of Andean Insurrection (18th century Peru) or Indigenous Conquistadors (16th century)—already imply a chronological and/or geographical focus, while others (for example: "Contracts, Wills, the Local Notary, and Social Change" OR "Indios Ladinos: Historical Writing, and the Spanish Legal System") are relevant in more than one time and place, leading to more flexibility in doing a research project. EMAIL YOUR TOPIC CHOICE TO ME BY TUESDAY JANUARY 22nd AT THE VERY LATEST. Research themes not covered in the syllabus are possible, but depend on prior instructor approval.
2. IDENTIFY AT LEAST ONE PRIMARY SOURCE (a document or documents created in the period under study) and FIVE BOOKS OR ARTICLES written by modern historians (secondary sources) and related to that topic.
3. Schedule (via email) a 20-minute meeting with me (or, if you plan to study colonial Mexico, possibly with our fantastic Latin American Librarian, Dr. Vargas-Betancourt: mvargasb@ufl.edu) to discuss sources and bibliography for your research project. The MEETING should take place BY OR BEFORE FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 8th.

GET TO KNOW DIGITAL SOURCES:

Check out "Digital History Links" at <https://www.maxdeardorff.org/>. Between the sections "Paleography Tools," "Early Americas," and "Indigenous Sources of Latin America", identify the website that you find most interesting. Be prepared at our next meeting to tell the class why you found it interesting and what.

WATCH:

Dr. Mark Z. Christensen Interview - Franciscan Florida in pan-Borderlands Perspective, March 14, 2014 [<https://youtu.be/4wiJ9yYN9cs>]

4. Indigenous Conquistadors – Native Soldiers in the Conquest of the Americas

Mon 1/28

READINGS:

- Matthew Restall, "Invisible Warriors: The Myth of the White Conquistador," in *Seven Myths of the Spanish Conquest* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003)
- Laura E. Matthew, "Whose Conquest?: Nahua, Zapoteca, and Mixteca Allies in the Conquest of Central America," in *Indian Conquistadors: Indigenous Allies in the Conquest of Mesoamerica*, Laura E. Matthew and Michel R. Oudijk eds. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2007): 102-126
- Yanna Yannakakis, "Allies or Servants? The Journey of Indian Conquistadors in the Lienzo of Analco" *Ethnohistory* 58:04 (2011): 653-682

DOCUMENT ANALYSIS:

- "A Case of Contested Identity: Domingo Pérez, Indigenous Immigrant in Ciudad Real, Chiapas" in *Documenting Latin America: Gender, Race and Empire*, vol. I

5. Indios Ladinos, Historical Writing, and the Spanish Legal System. I (Peru)

Mon 2/4

READINGS:

- Gabriela Ramos and Yanna Yannakakis, eds., *Indigenous Intellectuals: Knowledge, Power, and Colonial Culture in Mexico and the Andes* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2014), **chapters: Intro, 3, 7**
- Felipe Guaman Poma De Ayala, *The First New Chronicle and Good Government, Abridged*, David Frye ed. and transl. (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc., 2006): **chapters: Intro**

DOCUMENT ANALYSIS:

- Felipe Guaman Poma De Ayala, *The First New Chronicle and Good Government, Abridged*, David Frye ed. and transl. (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, Inc., 2006): **chapters: 6, 8**

6. The Age of Andean Insurrection (18th Century)

Mon 2/11

READINGS:

- Sergio Serulnikov, *Revolution in the Andes: The Age of Túpac Amaru* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2013), chapter 1
- Charles F. Walker, *The Tupac Amaru Rebellion* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2014), Introduction

Ward Stavig and Ella Schmidt eds., *The Tupac Amaru and Catarista Rebellions: An Anthology of Sources* (Indianapolis: Hackett, 2008): Introduction

DOCUMENT ANALYSIS:

Ward Stavig and Ella Schmidt eds., *The Tupac Amaru and Catarista Rebellions: An Anthology of Sources* (Indianapolis: Hackett, 2008): chapters IV-VII

7. Indios Ladinos, Historical Writing, and the Spanish Legal System, II (Mexico) & Library Visit with Dr. Vargas-Betancourt

Mon 2/18

ASSIGNMENT: Write a 1500-word (approx. 5-page) review of the readings from one of the prior weeks (2, 4, 5, 6, or 7). Discuss the insights provided by the readings. If you have read multiple authors on a related theme, identify any differences in their interpretation of historical processes. Finally, evaluate the methodology used; what documentary sources do the historians use? Where do they find them? Do they read the documents in a particular way? Do they approach them looking for specific types of information? The review is due via CANVAS before the start of class.

READINGS:

There are three chapters and one article listed below. Choose two of them to read.

Kevin Terraciano, "Three Texts in One: Book XII of the Florentine Codex," *Ethnohistory* 57:1 (Winter 2010): 51-72

Gabriela Ramos and Yanna Yannakakis, eds., *Indigenous Intellectuals: Knowledge, Power, and Colonial Culture in Mexico and the Andes* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2014), **chapters: 2, 5, 6**

8. Contracts, Wills, the Local Notary, and Social Change

Mon 2/25

ASSIGNMENT: Turn in annotated bibliography to professor by class time Monday (via CANVAS).

READINGS:

Sarah L. Cline, "The Testaments of Culhuacan," in James Lockhart, Lisa Sousa, and Stephanie Wood, eds., *Sources and Methods for the Study of Postconquest Mesoamerican Ethnohistory, Provisional Version* (2007):
<http://whp.uoregon.edu/Lockhart/index.html>

Caterina Pizzigoni, *Testaments of Toluca* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2007), introductory chapter

Kathryn Burns, "Notaries, Truth, and Consequences," *The American Historical Review* 110:2 (April 2005): 350-379

DOCUMENT ANALYSIS:

Karen Graubart, "Catalina de Agüero: A Mediating Life," in *Native Wills from the Colonial Americas: Dead Giveaways in a New World*, Mark Christensen and Jonathan Truitt eds. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2016): 19-39

SPRING BREAK : Mon 3/4 - Fri 3/8

9. Native Authorities, Mixed Legal Systems, Translation, and Crime

Mon 3/11

ASSIGNMENT: Turn in 250-word *précis* with thesis statement to professor by class time on Monday. Electronic submissions are acceptable. Tips on developing a thesis statement can be found here: [https://www.gvsu.edu/cms4/asset/CC3BFEEB-C364-E1A1-A5390F221AC0FD2D/thesis_statement\(2\).pdf](https://www.gvsu.edu/cms4/asset/CC3BFEEB-C364-E1A1-A5390F221AC0FD2D/thesis_statement(2).pdf)

READINGS:

Susan Kellogg, "Legal Documents as a Source for Ethnohistory" in James Lockhart, Lisa Sousa, and Stephanie Wood, eds., *Sources and Methods for the Study of Postconquest Mesoamerican Ethnohistory*, Provisional Version (2007)

<http://whp.uoregon.edu/Lockhart/index.html>

Woodrow Borah, *Justice by Insurance: The General Indian Court of Colonial Mexico and the Legal Aides of the Half-Real* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983): chapter 3, "The Experience of New Spain, 1519-1585" 25-54

Martina Schrader-Kniffki and Yanna Yannakakis, "Between the 'Old Law' and the New: Christian Translation, Indian Jurisdiction, and Criminal Justice in Colonial Oaxaca" *Hispanic American Historical Review* 96:3 (August 2016): 517-548

DOCUMENT ANALYSIS:

From Matthew Restall, Lisa Sousa, & Kevin Terraciano eds., *Mesoamerican Voices: Native Language Writings from Colonial Mexico, Yucatan, and Guatemala* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005) [ebook available via the Library website]: Chapter 7 "Crime and Punishment," 158-173

10. Land Rights and the Creation of Maps

Mon 3/18

READINGS:

Robert Haskett, "Primordial Titles," in James Lockhart, Lisa Sousa, and Stephanie Wood, eds., *Sources and Methods for the Study of Postconquest Mesoamerican*

Ethnohistory, Provisional Version (2007)

Gabriela Ramos and Yanna Yannakakis, eds., *Indigenous Intellectuals: Knowledge, Power, and Colonial Culture in Mexico and the Andes* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2014), **chapter 9**

John Chance, "Indian Town Government in Colonial Cuernavaca: Persistence, Adaptation, and Change," *Hispanic American Historical Review* 67, No. 2 (May 1987): 203-231 [Read 222-231 closely. You can skim the rest.]

Barbara Mundy, "Mapping Babel: A 16th Century Indigenous Map from Mexico," *The Appendix: A new journal of narrative & experimental history* (October 2013). [**access via her university website @ https://www.fordham.edu/info/22091/faculty_and_staff/5114/barbara_e_mundy/1**]

DOCUMENT ANALYSIS:

"3.2. Excerpt from the Nahuatl Annals of Tlatelolco"; "3.3. Images from the Lienzo of Tlaxcala"; "3.4. The Nahuatl Title of Mexicapan, Oaxaca"; "3.5. The Mixtec Title of Chapultepec, Oaxaca"; & "3.6. The Title of Motul, a Pech Maya Account of the Conquest" in Matthew Restall, Lisa Sousa, & Kevin Terraciano eds., *Mesoamerican Voices: Native Language Writings from Colonial Mexico, Yucatan, and Guatemala* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005): 44-56 [ebook available via the Library website]

11. NO CLASS. RESEARCH CONSULTATIONS WITH PROF.

Mon 3/25

12. Oral presentations in class

Mon 4/1

13. Oral presentations in class

Mon 4/8

First draft of research papers due via CANVAS

14. In-class Peer Review

Mon 4/15

15. Abbreviated Class Meeting

Mon 4/22

Complete research paper

APRIL 29 final essay due

WEBSITES WITH WRITING TIPS

<https://www.wm.edu/as/history/undergraduateprogram/hwrc/handouts/historypaperbasics/index.php>

<https://resources.library.lemoyne.edu/c.php?g=679043&p=4786381>

https://www.gvsu.edu/cms4/asset/CC3BFEEB-C364-E1A1-A5390F221AC0FD2D/history_research_paper_gg_final.pdf

<https://www.gvsu.edu/wc/handouts-other-resources-32.htm>

THE WRITING STUDIO

The UF Writing Studio

Office phone (352) 846-1138

<https://writing.ufl.edu/writing-studio/>

Hours of Operation:

Daytime — Monday – Friday 9:30 – 3:30 in 2215 Turlington Hall.

Evening tutoring hours — Monday – Thursday 5:00 – 7:00 p.m. in 339 Library West

The Writing Studio also offers online tutoring hours, which vary from term to term. Please check website to see available time slots, and then choose from either daytime, evening, or online tutoring.

Some possible topics for the final research project (This is just a sample.)

The experience of enslavement

Legal battles over the justification of native slavery

The Conquest of Guatemala

The Conquest of New Galicia (Mexico)

The Conquest of the Taínos (Caribbean)

The Perception of the Conquest, from Spain

Justice and Conflict on the Military Frontier of New Spain

Mesoamerican Reflections on History in the Aftermath of the Conquest

Guaman Poma and the Request for Good Government

Motivations in the Tupac Amaru and Catarista rebellions

Social change in daily life as seen through Spanish legal documents

Changes in local native government as seen through Spanish legal documents

Legal cases as evidence of social change